

# ***Supplementary Committee Agenda***



**Epping Forest  
District Council**

---

## ***Cabinet Thursday, 5th November, 2015***

**Place:** Council Chamber,  
Civic Offices, High Street, Epping

**Time:** 7.00 pm

**Democratic Services:** Gary Woodhall  
The Directorate of Governance  
Tel: 01992 564470  
Email: [democraticservices@eppingforestdc.gov.uk](mailto:democraticservices@eppingforestdc.gov.uk)

---

### **9. ACCEPTANCE OF TENDERS - ANNUAL GAS SERVICING AND MAINTENANCE CONTRACT (Pages 3 - 8)**

(Housing Portfolio Holder) The following Background Papers are attached:

1. Tender Assessment Matrices.

**This page is intentionally left blank**

Table 1- Initial Tendered Rates Lot 1: North.

Cost Comparison Initial Tendered Rates	British Gas/ PH Jones	BSW Heating	Gracelands CMS	K & T Heating Services
Lot 1: North Area	£ 359,243.64	£ 547,968.06	£ 198,388.68	£ 371,014.19

Table 2 - Cost Comparison Percentage Details Lot 1: North.

Cost Comparison Percentage Totals Lot 1: North	British Gas/ PH Jones	BSW Heating	Gracelands CMS	K & T Heating Services	Max Score Available %
<b>Labour Rates</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>8.00%</b>
Standard labour charge Monday to Friday 08:00 – 17:30	0.61%	0.58%	1.00%	0.95%	1.00%
Saturday labour charge 08:00 – 17:30	0.43%	0.49%	0.70%	1.00%	1.00%
Sunday labour charge 08:00 – 17:30	0.46%	0.56%	1.00%	0.95%	1.00%
Outside hours labour charge Monday - Friday	0.61%	0.65%	1.00%	0.95%	1.00%
Outside hours labour charge Saturday - Sunday	0.46%	0.56%	1.00%	0.71%	1.00%
Bank Holiday labour charge anytime	0.46%	0.56%	1.00%	0.71%	1.00%
Total cost for a breakdown call out charge during normal working hours	1.00%	0.56%	0.95%	0.91%	1.00%
Total cost for a breakdown call out charge during 'out of hours'.	0.57%	0.60%	1.00%	0.76%	1.00%
<b>SOR</b>					
Schedule of Rates	2.73%	4.08%	5.00%	3.92%	<b>5.00%</b>
<b>Servicing</b>					
Servicing Costs	10.00%	6.16%	8.11%	7.54%	<b>10.00%</b>
<b>Breakdown</b>					
Breakdown Costs	10.00%	6.39%	9.76%	9.85%	<b>10.00%</b>
<b>Overheads &amp; Profit</b>					
Average Enhanced Profit	0.80%	0.91%	0.75%	1.50%	<b>1.50%</b>
<b>Other</b>					
Central Office Overheads	1.78%	0.53%	2.00%	1.20%	<b>2.00%</b>
Site Overheads	0.71%	1.01%	1.67%	2.00%	<b>2.00%</b>
Normal' Profit	1.31%	1.50%	0.53%	0.29%	<b>1.50%</b>
<b>Total Weighting for each Bidder.</b>					
	<b>31.90%</b>	<b>25.12%</b>	<b>35.48%</b>	<b>33.24%</b>	<b>40.00%</b>

Table 3 - Cost Comparison Percentage Totals Lot 1: North.

Cost Evaluation Percentage Totals Lot 1: North	Labour Rates.	Schedule of Rates	Servicing	Breakdown	Overheads and Profit	Totals
Maximum Weighting Score Available %	<b>8.00%</b>	<b>5.00%</b>	<b>10.00%</b>	<b>10.00%</b>	<b>7.00%</b>	<b>40.00%</b>
British Gas/ PH Jones	4.58%	2.73%	10.00%	10.00%	4.59%	<b>31.90%</b>
BSW Heating	4.55%	4.08%	6.16%	6.39%	3.95%	<b>25.13%</b>
Gracelands CMS	7.66%	5.00%	8.11%	9.76%	4.95%	<b>35.48%</b>
K & T Heating Services	6.95%	3.92%	7.54%	9.85%	4.99%	<b>33.25%</b>

Table 4 - Quality Assessment Percentage Totals Lot 1: North.

Quality Assessment Comparison Percentage Totals Lot 1: North	Delivering a successful Contract	Quality of Repairs Service Delivery	Delivering Excellence	Delivering Value	Totals
Maximum Weighting Score Available %	<b>22.50%</b>	<b>20.00%</b>	<b>10.00%</b>	<b>7.50%</b>	<b>60.00%</b>
British Gas/ PH Jones	11.50%	13.00%	6.00%	4.50%	<b>35.00%</b>
BSW Heating	15.50%	14.50%	8.00%	4.00%	<b>42.00%</b>
Gracelands CMS	14.50%	13.00%	6.50%	5.50%	<b>39.50%</b>
K & T Heating Services	10.00%	12.00%	8.00%	4.50%	<b>34.50%</b>

Table 5 - Cost and Quality Evaluation Scores Lot 1: North.

Project % Value Bands Lot 1: North	British Gas/ PH Jones	BSW Heating	Gracelands CMS	K & T Heating Services
Cost Total - 40%	31.90%	25.12%	35.48%	33.24%
Quality Evaluation Total - 60%	35.00%	42.00%	39.50%	34.50%
<b>Total Score - 100%</b>	<b>66.90%</b>	<b>67.12%</b>	<b>74.98%</b>	<b>67.74%</b>

Table 6 - Overall Cost and Quality Scores Lot 1: North.

Overall Summary Lot 1: North	Quality Summary (Max 60%)	Cost Summary (Max 40%)	Total (Max 100%)	Ranking
<b>Gracelands CMS</b>	39.50%	35.48%	<b>74.98%</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>K &amp; T Heating Services</b>	34.50%	33.25%	<b>67.75%</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>BSW Heating</b>	42.00%	25.13%	<b>67.13%</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>British Gas/ PH Jones</b>	35.00%	31.90%	<b>66.90%</b>	<b>4</b>

Table 7 - Initial Tendered Rates Lot 2: South.

Cost Comparison Initial Tendered Rates.	British Gas/ PH Jones	BSW Heating	Gracelands CMS	K & T Heating Services
Lot 2: South Area	£ 357,746.08	£ 495,189.43	£ 185,321.08	£ 331,939.96

Table 8 - Cost Comparison Percentage Details Lot 2: South

Cost Comparison Percentage Totals Lot 2: South	British Gas/ PH Jones	BSW Heating	Gracelands CMS	K & T Heating Services	Max Score Available %
<b>Labour Rates</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>Score</b>	<b>8.00%</b>
Standard labour charge Monday to Friday 08:00 – 17:30	0.56%	0.58%	1.00%	0.95%	1.00%
Saturday labour charge 08:00 – 17:30	0.39%	0.49%	0.70%	1.00%	1.00%
Sunday labour charge 08:00 – 17:30	0.42%	0.56%	1.00%	0.95%	1.00%
Outside hours labour charge Monday - Friday	0.56%	0.65%	1.00%	0.95%	1.00%
Outside hours labour charge Saturday - Sunday	0.42%	0.56%	1.00%	0.71%	1.00%
Bank Holiday labour charge anytime	0.42%	0.56%	1.00%	0.71%	1.00%
Total cost for a breakdown call out charge during normal working hours	0.87%	0.59%	1.00%	0.95%	1.00%
Total cost for a breakdown call out charge during 'out of hours'.	0.53%	0.60%	1.00%	0.76%	1.00%
<b>SOR</b>					
Schedule of Rates	2.71%	4.08%	5.00%	3.92%	<b>5.00%</b>
<b>Servicing</b>					
Servicing Costs	10.00%	7.25%	9.42%	8.91%	<b>10.00%</b>
<b>Breakdown</b>					
Breakdown Costs	8.98%	6.40%	9.83%	10.00%	<b>10.00%</b>
<b>Overheads &amp; Profit</b>					
Average Enhanced Profit	0.80%	0.91%	0.75%	1.50%	<b>1.50%</b>
<b>Other</b>					
Central Office Overheads	1.81%	0.59%	2.00%	1.34%	<b>2.00%</b>
Site Overheads	0.73%	0.96%	1.47%	2.00%	<b>2.00%</b>
Normal' Profit	1.31%	1.50%	0.53%	0.29%	<b>1.50%</b>
<b>Total Weighting for each Bidder.</b>					
	<b>30.51%</b>	<b>26.26%</b>	<b>36.70%</b>	<b>34.95%</b>	<b>40.00%</b>

Table 9 - Cost Comparison Percentage Totals Lot 2: South.

Cost Evaluation Percentage Totals Lot 2: South.	Labour Rates.	Schedule of Rates	Servicing	Breakdown	Overheads and Profit	Totals
Maximum Weighting Score Available %	<b>8.00%</b>	<b>5.00%</b>	<b>10.00%</b>	<b>10.00%</b>	<b>7.00%</b>	<b>40.00%</b>
British Gas/ PH Jones	4.16%	2.71%	10.00%	8.98%	4.66%	<b>30.51%</b>
BSW Heating	4.58%	4.08%	7.25%	6.40%	3.96%	<b>26.27%</b>
Gracelands CMS	7.70%	5.00%	9.42%	9.83%	4.75%	<b>36.70%</b>
K & T Heating Services	6.99%	3.92%	8.91%	10.00%	5.13%	<b>34.95%</b>

Table 10 - Quality Assessment Percentage Totals Lot 2: South.

Quality Assessment Comparison Percentage Totals Lot 1: North	Delivering a successful Contract	Quality of Repairs Service Delivery	Delivering Excellence	Delivering Value	Totals
Maximum Weighting Score Available %	<b>22.50%</b>	<b>20.00%</b>	<b>10.00%</b>	<b>7.50%</b>	<b>60.00%</b>
British Gas/ PH Jones	11.50%	13.00%	6.00%	4.50%	<b>35.00%</b>
BSW Heating	15.50%	14.50%	8.00%	4.00%	<b>42.00%</b>
Gracelands CMS	14.50%	13.00%	6.50%	5.50%	<b>39.50%</b>
K & T Heating Services	10.00%	12.00%	8.00%	4.50%	<b>34.50%</b>

Table 11 - Cost and Quality Evaluation Scores Lot 2: South.

Project Value Band Lot 2: South	British Gas/ PH Jones	BSW Heating	Gracelands CMS	K & T Heating Services Ltd
Cost Total - 40%	30.51%	26.26%	36.70%	34.95%
Quality Evaluation Total - 60%	35.00%	42.00%	39.50%	34.50%
<b>Total Score - 100%</b>	<b>65.51%</b>	<b>68.26%</b>	<b>76.20%</b>	<b>69.45%</b>

Table 12 - Overall Cost and Quality Scores Lot 2: South.

Overall Summary Lot 2: South	Quality Summary (Max 60%)	Cost Summary (Max 40%)	Total (100%)	Ranking
<b>Gracelands CMS</b>	39.50%	36.70%	<b>76.20%</b>	<b>1</b>
<b>K &amp; T Heating Services</b>	34.50%	34.95%	<b>69.45%</b>	<b>2</b>
<b>BSW Heating</b>	42.00%	26.27%	<b>68.27%</b>	<b>3</b>
<b>British Gas/ PH Jones</b>	35.00%	30.51%	<b>65.51%</b>	<b>4</b>